

1 <u>AMENDED PERMIT APPLICATION TO INCREASE HOURS OF</u> <u>OPERATION AT 1 ALBER ROAD, BEACONSFIELD UPPER</u>

FILE REFERENCE INT163559

RESPONSIBLE GENERAL MANAGER Phil Walton

AUTHOR Katherine Gilpin

RECOMMENDATION

That a Notice of Decision to Grant Amended Permit T970503-2 be issued to amend Condition 4 in association with the use and development of the land as a Rural Industry (Winery) in respect of the land known and described as Lot 2 PS400704, 1 Alber Road, Beaconsfield Upper subject to the conditions attached to this report.

 Attachments 1 Locality plan 2 Application plans 3 Confidential objection letters cir 	1 Page 1 Page culated to councillors only 16 Pages	
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:		
APPLICATION NO .:	T970503	
APPLICANT:	Rebecca Carlei	
LAND:	Lot 2 PS400704, 1 Alber Road, Beaconsfield Upper	
PROPOSAL:	Amendment to Condition 4 of T970503-1 to increase patron hours	
PLANNING CONTROLS:	Green Wedge A Zone – Schedule 1 (GWAZ1)	
	Bushfire Management Overlay (BMO), Environmental Significance Overlay – Schedule 1 (ESO1)	
NOTIFICATION & OBJECTIONS:	The application was advertised pursuant to Section 52 of the <i>Planning and Environment Act 1987</i> , by sending notices to adjoining and surrounding land owners and occupiers and by placing one (1) sign on the site. The advertising was undertaken correctly and the Statutory Declaration was received 9 December, 2015. Six (6) objections were received.	
KEY PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS:	Hours of operation, objections received	
RECOMMENDATION:	It is recommended that the application be supported to amend Condition 4 of the permit, to allow increased hours at the property	



BACKGROUND:

Planning permit T970503 was issued 19 November, 1997 which allowed for the use and development of the land as a Rural Industry (Winery) generally in accordance with the approved plan.

Planning Permit T970503 was amended 26 November, 1998 to become T970503A. Condition 4 was amended and an additional condition included.

Planning Permit T000931 was issued 6 December, 2000 which allowed for the use and development of the land for the purpose of extending the existing winery building generally in accordance with the approved plans.

Planning Permit T020544 was issued 19 December, 2002 which allowed for the use of the land for the purpose of viticulture and a winery and for the construction of buildings and works associated with the land for use of a bed and breakfast accommodation for a winery, in accordance with the endorsed plan/s.

Planning Permit T020544 was amended 9 September, 2010 at the direction of VCAT. VCAT ordered that the permit be amended by the deletion of Condition 1 (f), change the wording of Condition 1 (e) and renumber conditions accordingly.

Planning Permit T060798 was issued 4 June, 2007 which allowed for the development of the land for the purpose of buildings and works that include a concrete pavement area.

SUBJECT SITE

Lot 2 PS400704 is located on the southern side of Alber Road. A crossover is located across the front of the site (northern boundary) and there are no known easements located on the property. The site currently contains a large shed (store), several small buildings and the main winery building. The topography of the land slopes down from the north to the south-west of the site. Vines exist to the south and the east of the site.

The main characteristics of the surrounding area are:

- North: Alber Road forms the northern property boundary. To the north of Alber Road, two rural/residential lots exist. Both contain residential dwellings and ancillary development.
- **South:** Residential properties exist to the south of the site. The allotments front Grant Court, which is located further to the south.
- **East:** Residential properties and the Pine Grove Hotel exist to the east of the site. The allotments front Stoney Creek Road, which is located further to the east.
- West: A property also owned by the applicant exists to the west, which is run in-conjunction with the subject site. Further to the west a rural /residential property exists. The property contains a residential dwelling and ancillary development, vegetation exists along the shared boundary.

PROPOSAL

The applicant has applied under Section 72 of the Planning and Environment Act 1987 to amend planning permit T970503-A by extending the operating hours.

Currently Condition 4 of Planning Permit T970503-A reads as follows:

The sale of wine from the premises associated with the use may only occur between the hours of:



Monday – Friday Saturday & Public Holidays Sunday 9.00am to 6.00pm 9.00am to 8.00pm 10.00am to 6.00pm

Notwithstanding the above, the premises may also be open to the public until 11.00pm for promotional events or the like on twelve (12) occasions only per annum.

The application requests an increase in opening hours to:

Monday to Sunday 10.00am to 11.00pm

The application states that the reason behind the proposed extension to trading hours is due to an increasing number of both domestic and international clients seeking to visit the winery outside of normal business hours which is restricting trade. Business opportunities for the winery are increasing with China and the proposed extension of hours is requested to enable Chinese delegates to visit the site and undertake business discussions. The applicant has stated that the request is only for a change to operational hours and not for any buildings and works; and that they expect there to be no changes to noise, traffic or environmental impacts.

PLANNING SCHEME PROVISIONS

State Planning Policy Framework (SPPF)

The relevant clauses of the SPPF are:

- Clause 17.01-1 Business
- Clause 19.02-3 Cultural Activities

Local Planning Policy Framework (LPPF)

The relevant clauses of the LPPF are:

- Clause 21.01-4 Strategic vision
- Clause 21.04-5 Tourism
- Clause 21.07-5 Upper Beaconsfield

Relevant Particular/ General Provisions and relevant incorporated or reference documents

The relevant provisions/ documents are:

- Clause 52.27 Licence premises
- Clause 52.43 Live music and entertainment noise

Zone

The land is subject to the Green Wedge A Zone – Schedule 1 (GWAZ1)

Overlays

The land is subject to the following overlays:

• Bushfire Management Overlay (BMO)



• Environmental Significance Overlay – Schedule 1 (ESO1)

PLANNING PERMIT TRIGGERS

The proposal for an amended permit to increase the hours of operation to sell wine requires a planning permit under the following clauses of the Cardinia Planning Scheme and sections of the *Planning and Environment Act* 1987:

- Pursuant to Section 72 of the *Planning and Environment Act* 1987 person who is entitled to use or develop land in accordance with a permit may apply to the Responsible Authority for an amendment to the permit.
- Pursuant to Clause 35.05-1 a permit is required to use the land for a Section 2 use (winery is an unspecified land use, which is not listed as prohibited).

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION

The application has been advertised pursuant to Section 52 of the *Planning and Environment Act* 1987, by:

- Sending notices to the owners and occupiers of adjoining land.
- Placing a sign on the site

The notification has been carried out correctly, and Council has received eight (8) objections to date.

The key issues that were raised in the objections are:

- Hours of opening proposed are excessive (too late, unnecessary)
- Loss of amenity for surrounding residents (late hours, increased noise and production, yard lights shining into properties)
- Concern that extending opening hours will allow increase of production/processing on site (which leads to increased noise, increased vehicles, loss of amenity)
- Existing noise concerns and late night processing/operations (processing machinery, forklifts, moving pallets are loud already and potential to increase at night if hours are extended)
- Lack of consideration for property owners with common boundaries and lack of communication between neighbours (fireworks being set off, residents not given warning about spraying, noise from spraying)
- Existing issues associated with smell, maintenance of the site (lack of mowing, fire hazards, spraying of crops)
- Was originally meant to be a boutique winery not a production facility (most grapes are brought into the site, no harvesting from the site)
- Commercial winery operation boarding close to residential properties, should have required a buffer zone.
- Pine Grove Pub opening hours are limited why is winery different?
- Winery ignores permit conditions and directives of VCAT
- There will be no increased local employment opportunities.



REFERRALS

Emerald Police

Emerald Police have advised they have no objection to the proposal.

There were no other external or internal referrals.

DISCUSSION

State and Local Planning Policy Frameworks, and Green Wedge A Zone

It is considered that the proposal is consistent with most of the relevant policies of the State and Local Planning Policies including the Municipal Strategic Statement and the Cardinia Shire Vision, and with the purposes of the Green Wedge A Zone.

The winery is contributing to the tourism industry within the hills area of the Shire and is a permit issued rural land use within the Green Wedge A Zone. The Planning Permits issued for the winery included conditions to regulate the hours during which processing and manufacturing can occur to provide a reasonable level of amenity for existing residents. The proposal is to extend the opening hours during which wine can be sold, which can be regulated through an appropriate condition to ensure this aspect of the winery does not cause material detriment.

Overall the proposed extension to opening hours for the sale of wine is considered to be in keeping with the requirements and purposes of the relevant State and Local Planning Policy objectives and the purposes of the Green Wedge A Zone.

Extension to operating hours:

The applicant has applied under Section 72 of the Planning and Environment Act 1987 to amend planning permit T970503-A by extending the hours during which wine can be sold.

Currently Condition 4 of Planning Permit T970503-A reads as follows:

The sale of wine from the premises associated with the use may only occur between the hours of:

Monday – Friday	9.00am to 6.00pm
Saturday & Public Holidays	9.00am to 8.00pm
Sunday	10.00am to 6.00pm

Notwithstanding the above, the premises may also be open to the public until 11.00pm for promotional events or the like on twelve (12) occasions only per annum.

The application requests an increase in opening hours to:

Monday to Sunday 10.00am to 11.00pm

Council Officers discussed the application with the applicant to ascertain the reasoning behind the request for extension of the hours and to determine what hours might be appropriate for the site. The applicant advised that they are currently experiencing an increase in business opportunities in China and that the way business is conducted in China varies significantly to the way business is conducted both domestically and in other international countries. The applicant advised that generally business delegates from China wish to see the operations of the business from the origins



of the grapes, through the manufacturing process and then finally to the production and sale of the wine.

From the applicant's perspective, it is preferable to have these meetings outside of normal trading hours to reduce the impact on the day-to-day experiences of the general public at the winery, by providing a separation between larger and smaller scale business discussions/opportunities.

Council Officers are of the view that the part of Condition 4 which allows the winery to be open to the public until 11.00pm for promotional events or the like on twelve (12) occasions per annum, could be extended to allow twenty four (24) events per annum with a restriction that there only be 50 patrons, no alcohol to be consumed in outdoor areas beyond 9.00pm and that no machinery may be used during these times. This would allow the winery to expand business opportunities, whilst restricting the number of patrons and the potential for external noise. Excluding alcohol consumption beyond 9.00pm in outdoor areas, reduces the potential for excessive patron noise associated with people standing around talking and drinking alcohol. Placing a restriction on the number of patrons allowed on these occasions, provides a level of expectation that these events will not turn into loud and excessive "parties" or functions, and allowing appropriate enforcement action to be undertaken if required.

In order to allay concerns regarding an increase in noise associated with the production, manufacturing and processing of grapes on the land, it is considered relevant to include a condition requiring no machinery to be used during these events (this is to include manufacturing machinery, forklifts etc.).

Objections:

As a result of the advertising, eight (8) objections were received to the application. The issues raised in the objections are considered below:

Hours of opening proposed are excessive (too late, unnecessary)

The application proposed extending the opening hours until 11pm, seven (7) nights per week which was considered by Council officers to be excessive. The applicant was advised that it was unlikely such hours would be supported and it was discussed as to what would be a better alternative to allow some flexibility for the business to operate and conduct business, whilst maintaining and not negatively impacting on the amenity of surrounding land owners and occupiers. It was put forward that Council officers would consider increasing the number of times per annum that wine sales could be undertaken until 11pm from twelve (12) times to twenty four (24) times per year, with restrictions during these times on the number of patrons, restrictions on alcohol being consumed in outdoor areas after 9.00 pm and that no machinery be used during these times, except in accordance with the conditions set out in Planning Permit T020544.

Loss of amenity for surrounding residents (late hours, increased noise and production, yard lights shining into properties, smell, lack of maintenance of the site (mowing), spraying of crops) The loss of amenity mentioned in the objections appears to relate directly to a concern that the winery is proposing to expand their operations on the site, which may lead to more processing/manufacturing activity on the site. The applicant has applied to amend the condition relating to the sale of wine (contained in Condition 4 of T970503-A) only.

All other conditions of Planning Permits T970503-A and T020544 which relate to manufacturing and processing on the site remain current and are not the subject to this application. Planning Permit T020544 at condition 15 states that crushing of grapes must not occur after 9.00pm and before 8.00am on any day. Condition 16 states that noise levels from the site must not exceed the permissible levels specified in the relevant SEPP or EPA Guideline and noise levels other than grape



harvesting operations must not exceed 40 dB(A) at the southern boundary of the property during the daytime or evening period and 32 dB(A) during the night-time period (10.00pn to 7.00am).

It is considered that a reasonable level of amenity for surrounding residents would be able to be maintained by restricting the number of times per annum the winery can be open until 11pm and by restricting patron numbers, alcohol consumption in outdoor areas and the use of machinery during these times.

With relation to concerns regarding smell, bright yard lights and noise, Condition 14 of Planning Permit T970503-A is relevant and states that:

The amenity of the area must not be detrimentally affected by the use or development, through the:

- The transport of materials, goods or commodities to or from the land;
- Appearance of any buildings, works or materials;
- Emission of noise, artificial light, vibration, small, fumes, smoke, vapour, steam, soot, ash, dust, waste water, waste products, grit or oil; or
- Presence of vermin

It is considered that this condition allows for potential enforcement by relevant Council Officers, particularly in relation to smell, lights and noise emissions.

Also in relation to noise associated with manufacturing/processing of grapes, Planning Permit T020544 at condition 15 states that crushing of grapes must not occur after 9.00pm and before 8.00am on any day. Condition 16 states that noise levels from the site must not exceed the permissible levels specified in the relevant SEPP or EPA Guideline and noise levels other than grape harvesting operations must not exceed 40 dB(A) at the southern boundary of the property during the daytime or evening period and 32 dB(A) during the night-time period (10.00pn to 7.00am). It is considered that this condition has been included to provide a level of amenity for surrounding residents, particularly during night-time hours, and allows for potential enforcement by relevant Council Officers.

The maintenance of the site is not directly linked with this proposal to increase the proposed opening hours. It is the permit holder and property owner's responsibility to maintain the site in a manner which reduces fire hazards and risk. However Condition 14 of Planning Permit T970503-A specifically addresses the amenity of the area not being detrimentally affected by the use or development and as such this can also be addressed through appropriate enforcement action.

Winery ignores permit conditions and directives of VCAT

The conditions on Planning Permit T970503-A and on the VCAT issued Planning Permit T020544 provide a valid tool for enforcement to ensure the winery is operating within the confines of both planning permits.

Existing noise concerns and late night processing/operations (processing machinery, forklifts, moving pallets are loud already and potential to increase at night if hours are extended) With regards to late night processing and operations allegedly occurring on the site, both planning permits T970503-A and T020544 contain conditions to control the manufacturing, processing and operations associated with the winery and the times during which produce may be processed. These conditions are enforceable under planning controls and were included on the permits to allow the operation of the winery whilst still maintaining a reasonable level of amenity of the surrounding residents.

In this situation, the applicant is not seeking to amend any conditions relating to processing, manufacturing or operations on the site, rather they have applied to amend the condition relating to the sale of wine (contained in Condition 4 of T970503-A) only and as such this is what must be



considered. Council Officers are of the view that the proposed amendment to Condition 4 of Planning Permit T970503-A will ensure that a reasonable level of amenity is afforded to surrounding residents by way of minimising the number of times the venue can be open until 11pm, by restricting consumption of alcohol in outdoor areas (to keep associated noise inside the venue) and by restricting the use of machinery/processing equipment during these times. The proposed amendment to the condition will allow means to undertaken appropriate enforcement action, if required.

Lack of consideration for property owners with common boundaries and lack of communication between neighbours (fireworks being set off, residents not given warning about spraying, noise from spraying)

These are civil matters between property owners and the relevant guidelines of the Environmental Protection Authority (EPA) are applicable.

Commercial winery operation boarding close to residential properties should have required a buffer zone.

There are no listed recommended separation distances for wineries near sensitive land uses. The land is located within a Green Wedge A Zone and rural land uses are encouraged in these areas. There must also be a balance between rural land uses and residential land uses, as everyone is entitled to a reasonable level of amenity. It is considered that when the winery was established it complied with the relevant guidelines of the time, and that all associated practices must be in accordance with the relevant EPA guidelines, particularly with regards to noise, smell and spraying of crops.

Was originally meant to be a boutique winery not a production facility (most grapes are brought into the site, no harvesting from the site)

While the original intent of the application may have been to operate as a "boutique winery", the planning permits issued to the land detail the operations which may occur on the site. The conditions of the permit do not specify where the grapes must be sought from.

Planning Permit T970503-A detailed at Condition 6 that no more than thirty (30) tons of produce may be processed on the land and no more than twenty thousand (20, 000) bottles may be sold either through the cellar door outlet or sold wholesale from the property without further permission of the Responsible Authority. While Planning Permit T020544, at Condition 6 allows no more than 200 tonnes per annum to be produced from the winery without the further written consent of the responsible authority.

It is Council officers view that this is not relevant in the consideration of this proposal to change the hours during which wine can be sold.

Pine Grove Pub opening hours are limited - why is winery different?

The current liquor license for the Pine Grove Hotel, which is located to the east of the site, allows on-site liquor consumption on Sundays until 11:30pm and on other days (excluding public holidays and special events) up until midnight. If the Hotel chooses to close at an earlier time, that is at their discretion.

Council officers recommend that Condition 4 of the permit be amended to allow twenty four (24) occasions per annum where trading can extend to 11.00pm, but that this be restricted to only allow 50 patrons, no alcohol to be consumed in outdoor areas after 9.00pm and to restrict the use of machinery (including but not limited to forklifts, trucks and manufacturing/processing machinery).



It is Council officer's view that the impacts of later opening hours for the sale of wine at a winery would not have the same impact as that of a Hotel which is a more concentrated land use and that the above amendment would allow for the protection of the amenity of the area.

There will be no increased local employment opportunities.

The proposed amendment is in relation to amending Condition 4 of the permit by extending the opening hours for the sale of wine and or promotional events at the site. Whether the permit holder chooses to employ local employees or not is at their discretion, provided they comply with the conditions of the existing permit. Planning controls do not cover employment of workers and as such, while the applicant may have mentioned a desire to employ locals, this is not a relevant planning consideration of this proposal.

CONCLUSION

It is considered that the application to amend Planning Permit T970503-A is consistent with the requirements of the Cardinia Planning Scheme and should be approved subject to the amendment to conditions outlined below.

CONDITIONS

It is recommended that Condition 4 of Planning Permit T970503-A be amended to read:

Condition 4:

The sale of wine form the premises associated with the use may only occur between the hours of:

Monday - Friday9.00am to 6.00pmSaturday & Public Holidays9.00am to 8.00pmSunday10.00am to 6.00pm

Notwithstanding the above, the premises may also be open to the public until 11.00pm for promotional events or the like on twenty four (24) occasions only per annum. During these times:

- No more than fifty (50) patrons may be in attendance;
- No alcohol may be consumed in outdoor areas after 9.00pm; and
- The use of machinery (including, but not limited to, forklifts & manufacturing machinery/equipment) is prohibited, except in accordance with the conditions of Planning Permit T020544.

FULL CONDITIONS WITH AMENDMENTS TO BE PLACED ON THE AMENDED PERMIT:

- 1. The use and development must not be commenced until three (3) copies of amended plans have been submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. The plans must be drawn to scale with dimensions. The plans must submitted within two (2) years of the date of the permit. When approved the plans will form part of the permit. The plans must be generally in accordance with the submitted plans but modified to show car parking facilities which can accommodate four (4) visitor car spaces to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.
- 2. The layout of the site and the size of the proposed buildings and works, as shown on the approved plan, shall not be altered or modified without the consent in writing of the Responsible Authority.



- 3. The buildings must not be occupied and the uses must not be commenced until the areas set aside for car parking and access lanes as shown on the approved plan/s have been:
 - paved with crushed rock or gravel or adequate thickness as necessary to prevent the formation of potholes and depressions according to the nature of sub grade and vehicles which will use the areas;
 - (ii) drained;
 - (iii) treated to prevent dust emissions;

to the satisfaction of the responsible authority. The car parking area shall be maintained in accordance with these requirements once constructed.

4. The sale of wine form the premises associated with the use may only occur between the hours of:

Monday – Friday	9.00am to 6.00pm
Saturday & Public Holidays	9.00am to 8.00pm
Sunday	10.00am to 6.00pm

Notwithstanding the above, the premises may also be open to the public until 11.00pm for promotional events or the like on twenty four (24) occasions only per annum. During these times:

- No more than fifty (50) patrons may be in attendance;
- No alcohol may be consumed in outdoor areas after 9.00pm; and
- The use of machinery (including, but not limited to, forklifts & manufacturing machinery/equipment) is prohibited, except in accordance with the conditions of Planning Permit T020544.
- 5. No more than three (3) persons shall be occupied or employed in the operation of the industry without the further written permission of the responsible authority.
- 6. In every year no more than thirty (30) tons of produce may be processed on the land and no more than twenty thousand (20,000) bottles may be sold either through the cellar door outlet or sold wholesale from the property without the further written permission of the Responsible Authority.
- 7. Prior to the commencement of works plans which provide details of the processing and bottling area must be provided to the satisfaction of the responsible authority.
- 8. The premises are to be constructed so as to comply with the Food Act and the requirements of the responsible authority.
- 9. The premises must be registered with responsible authority as a food premises.
- 10. Any wastewater produced is to be disposed of in a manner approved by the Responsible Authority.
- 11. All stormwater discharged from the site must be conveyed by means of drains to satisfactory points or areas of discharge approved by the responsible authority so that it will not detrimentally effect the health and welfare of the community or prejudicially affect the amenity of the locality.
- 12. Within three (3) months of the completion of the building, the area between the barn and the western boundary must be planted with trees and shrubs indigenous to the area. Once



planted the trees and shrubs must be maintained in a healthy condition to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

- 13. The loading and unloading of vehicles and the delivery of goods to and from the premises must at all times be carried on entirely within the site and be so conducted as to cause minimum interference with other traffic.
- 14. The amenity of the area must not be detrimentally affected by the use or development, through the:
 - (a) Transport of materials, goods or commodities to or from the land;
 - (b) Appearance of any building, works or materials;
 - (c) Emission of noise, artificial light, vibration, smell, fumes, smoke, vapour, steam, soot, ash, dust, waste water, waste products, grit or oil; or
 - (d) Presence of vermin
- 15. No advertising sign shall be erected, painted or displayed on the land or any nearby road without the permission of the responsible authority.
- 16. Only wine which is processed on the land may be sold from the premises.
- 17. This permit will expire if.
 - (a) the use and development is not commenced within two (2) years of the date of this permit; or
 - (b) the development is not completed within four (4) years of the date of this permit.

The Responsible Authority may extend the periods referred to, if a request is made in writing before the permit expires or within three (3) months afterwards.



achment 2	Application plans	
18-SEP-2015 12:3	1 From:	To:59413784 Page:2/7
		Wines Carlei Estate & Carlei Green Vineyards
Cardinia	ember, 2015 Shire Council 7.Pakenham,	
ATTN P	anning Department,	
This ap	lication is to request an extension of operating hours	Currently, the operational hours are:
	to Friday – 10.00am to 6.00pm y – 10.00am to 8.00pm	
We nee	d to increase our opening hours to the following:	
Sunday Saturda	to Friday – 10.00am to 11.00pm y – 10.00am to 11.00pm	
internat	son for this application is that an increasing number o onal - who purchase our wine want to come out of no e our current hours are restrictive to our trade.	f our clients - both domestic and rmal working business hours, and
to China they co busines several	t years, there has been a significant increase in expo a. Extending our hours will help us to grow our busine nduct business quite differently to the standard Weste s decisions are made communally in a social setting of these types of meeting before a final decision is m red in the evenings.	ss with prospective Chinese buyers, as in approach. In Chinese culture, around a dining table, and there can be
our bus this will	proach is fundamental in the Chinese culture and is the ness. By extending our hours, we will be able to bette only increase and help to expand our business, it will an more employment opportunities for the area.	r accommodate these customers. As
building	uest is only for the change in operational hours and v s or facilities, therefore there will not be any change i to the surrounding area.	ve will not be changing any of our normal noise, traffic or environmental
Please the title my offic	find attached our application to amend our current pe to the property. If you require any more information, r e.	mit, red line plan, as well as a copy of lease do not hesitate to contact me or
Warme	st Regards,	
ر	engis Carli	
Directo	r & Winemaker. The Green Vinevards Pty Ltd	

The Green Vineyards Pty Ltd Office: PO Box 180, Upper Beaconsfield. Victoria. 3808. Australia Winery: 1 Alber Road, Upper Beaconsfield. Victoria 3808. Australia. Phone/Fax: +61 (0)3 59 444 599 Mobile: +61 (0)411 591 805 www.carlei.com.au sergio@greenvineyards.com.au